IN THE COURT OF COMMON PLEAS, FRANKLIN COUNTY, OHIO

Winfrey Penix, as Administrator of the Estate of Melissa Ann Penix,

Plaintiff,

VS.

Mount Carmel Health System d/b/a Mount Carmel West, et al.,

Defendants.

Case No. 2019 CV 1138

Judge Jenifer A. French

Jury Demand Endorsed Hereon

ANSWER OF DEFENDANT WILLIAM S. HUSEL, D.O., TO PLAINTIFF'S COMPLAINT

Now comes Defendant William S. Husel, D.O., and answers Plaintiff's Complaint as follows:

1. This answering Defendant specifically admits that William S. Husel, D.O., is a doctor duly licensed to practice medicine by and in the State of Ohio. This answering Defendant states that Melissa Penix was 82 years old when she came to the emergency department at Mount Carmel West with increasing shortness of breath, which she reported she had for weeks. She stated she couldn't walk 5 feet without having shortness of breath. The physicians noted she had a complex medical history with multiple cardiac procedures and atrial fibrillation. She also had gout, esophageal reflux disorder, hypertension, peripheral neuropathy affecting the lower extremity, hiatal hernia, depression, hyperlipidemia, kidney stones, mild to moderate mitral valve regurgitation, moderate aortic stenosis, renal artery stenosis, and a rectocele. She was coughing up blood and was admitted with a diagnosis of suspected pneumonia and congestive heart failure. Her breathing continued to worsen, requiring greater and greater support. Ultimately, she had to be transferred to the ICU, where intubation and

Law Offices Of

ARNOLD TODARO
WELCH & FOLIANO

2075 MARBLE CLIFF OFFICE PARK COLUMBUS, OHIO 43215-1053 (614) 485-1800 mechanical ventilation were required. Despite intubation, she required medications to support her blood pressure. Though the doctors continued to increase her blood pressure support, unfortunately Ms. Penix continued to fail, resulting in the need for maximum support. Her family decided she would not want to be put on a ventilator and requested removal of the support that was sustaining Ms. Penix's life. For want of knowledge, because they are not true, or as a matter of form because the allegations are not directed at this answering Defendant and/or require no responsive pleading, this answering Defendant denies any and all remaining allegations made and contained in paragraph 15 of Plaintiff's Complaint.

- 2. For want of knowledge, because they are not true, or as a matter of form because the allegations are not directed at this answering Defendant and/or require no responsive pleading, this answering Defendant denies any and all allegations made and contained in paragraphs 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 16, 17, 18, 19, 20, 21, 22, 23, 24, 25, 26, 27, 28, 29, 30, 31, 32, 33, 34, 35, 36, 37, 38, 39, 40, 41, 42, 43, 44, 45, 46, 47, 48, 49, 50, 51, 52, 53, 54, 55, 56, 57, 58, 59, 60, 61, 62, 63, 64, 65, 66, 67, 68, 69, 70, 71, 72, 73 and 74 of Plaintiff's Complaint.
- 3. This answering Defendant denies any and all allegations set forth in Plaintiff's Complaint that are not specifically admitted as true herein.

AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES

- 4. This Defendant is immune to this suit and not liable in damages in this tort or any tort of this nature pursuant to R.C. 1337.15 et. seq. and R.C. 2133.11 et. seq.
- 5. Plaintiff's Complaint, in whole or in part, fails to state a claim upon which relief may be granted.

Law Offices Of

ARNOLD TODARO WELCH & FOLIANO

2075 Marble Cliff Office Park Columbus, Ohio 43215-1053 (614) 485-1800

- 6. Plaintiff's claims for recovery are barred by the equitable doctrines of waiver, estoppel (and/or promissory estoppel) and/or laches.
 - 7. Plaintiff's Complaint is inadequate pursuant to Civil Rule 10(D)(2).
- 8. Plaintiff has failed to join necessary and/or indispensable parties pursuant to Rules 19 and 19.1 of the Ohio Rules of Civil Procedure.
- 9. Plaintiff and/or Plaintiff's decedent's claimed injuries and damages were caused by the superseding and/or intervening acts of other parties or persons over whom this Defendant had and could have had no control.
- 10. This Defendant is entitled to a set-off of damages and/or limitation of damages pursuant to statute.
- 11. The injuries and damages of which Plaintiff complains are contributed to by one or more persons from whom Plaintiff did not seek recovery in this action pursuant to R.C. 2307.23(C).
 - 12. Plaintiff may not be the real party in interest over all or part of this claim.
 - 13. Plaintiff may lack capacity to pursue this action.
 - 14. Defendant asserts the defense of failure to mitigate damages.
 - 15. Defendant asserts the defense of legal waiver.
- 16. Defendant asserts the defense of the statute of frauds as to any applicable claims.
- 17. Defendant asserts the defense of parol evidence as to any applicable claims.
 - 18. Defendant asserts a lack of privity.
- 19. As to any applicable causes of action, Defendant asserts the defense of lack of malice and/or lack of intent.

Law Offices Of

ARNOLD TODARO WELCH & FOLIANO

2075 Marble Cliff Office Park Columbus, Ohio 43215-1053 (614) 485-1800 20. This answering Defendant respectfully reserves the right to assert additional affirmative defenses if ongoing discovery reveals that such defenses are warranted.

WHEREFORE, having fully answered Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant William S. Husel, D.O., prays that Plaintiff's Complaint be dismissed as against him with prejudice and that he be allowed to go hence without delay and with his costs.

ARNOLD TODARO WELCH & FOLIANO CO., L.P.A.

By: /s/ Gregory B. Foliano

Gregory B. Foliano (0047239) 2075 Marble Cliff Office Park Columbus, Ohio 43215 gfoliano@arnoldlaw.net

Phone: (614) 324-4533 Fax: (614) 324-4534 Counsel for Defendant William S. Husel, D.O.

JURY DEMAND

Defendant William S. Husel, D.O., hereby demands a trial by jury of the within action.

/s/ Gregory B. Foliano
Gregory B. Foliano (0047239)

Law Offices Of

ARNOLD TODARO
WELCH & FOLIANO

2075 MARBLE CLIFF OFFICE PARK COLUMBUS, OHIO 43215-1053 (614) 485-1800

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The undersigned hereby certifies that a true and accurate copy of the foregoing was filed with the Clerk via this Court's ECF/eFiling system this 30th day of April, 2019, which will provide service to all counsel of record.

<u>/s/ Gregory B. Foliano</u> Gregory B. Foliano (0047239)

Law Offices Of

ARNOLD TODARO WELCH & FOLIANO

2075 MARBLE CLIFF OFFICE PARK COLUMBUS, OHIO 43215-1053 (614) 485-1800